Journal of Archaeological Science xxx (2012)  $1-11$  $1-11$ 

Contents lists available at SciVerse ScienceDirect

# Journal of Archaeological Science

journal homepage:<http://www.elsevier.com/locate/jas>

# New insights into the consumption of maize and other food plants in the pre-Columbian Caribbean from starch grains trapped in human dental calculus

Hayley L. Mickleburgh<sup>a,\*</sup>, Jaime R. Pagán-Jiménez<sup>a,b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Faculty of Archaeology, Leiden University, P.O. Box 9515, 2300 RA, Leiden, Zuid Holland, The Netherlands <sup>b</sup> Centro de Estudios Avanzados de Puerto Rico y el Caribe, San Juan, Puerto Rico

#### article info

Article history: Received 13 December 2011 Received in revised form 14 February 2012 Accepted 20 February 2012

Keywords: Starch grains Dental calculus Diet Plant microremains Caribbean Pre-Columbian Maize

## ABSTRACT

In a first region wide study, starch grains from human dental calculus from the pre-Columbian insular Caribbean (dating to ca. 350 B.C.–A.D. 1600) are used to identify important plant foods in the diet and to assess potential dietary differences related to age or sex. Results give important insights into pre-Columbian maize (Zea mays) consumption throughout the region, confirming recent studies that indicate that maize was more commonly consumed in the insular Caribbean than originally thought. No age or sex based differences in maize consumption were found. Furthermore, based on the results of new experiments regarding grinding and pressure damage to starch grains, it is clear that maize in the Caribbean was ground, baked and consumed as bread as was the case in large parts of the mainland. Based on our results we tentatively suggest maize consumption in the Caribbean was at least in some cases associated with feasting and ceremonial activities. The variety in other plant foods identified (mostly tuberous root crops) shows that the pre-Columbian inhabitants of the region consumed a broad spectrum, but locally variable diet in which a variety of root crops functioned as staple crops, including marunguey (Zamia sp.) and sweet potato (Ipomoea batatas). We found no indications for the traditionally assumed heavy reliance on manioc (Manihot esculenta) cultivation in the region.

2012 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved.

## 1. Introduction

Our understanding of pre-Columbian plant exploitation in the Caribbean is somewhat convoluted by the region's (sub)tropical climate, which hampers the preservation of botanical remains. Despite this, paleoethnobotanical research over the past few decades has immensely improved our understanding of pre-Columbian plant use in the region, bringing to light a long history of Amerindian plant exploitation and cultivation, characterized by intensification and diversification of plant reliance over time, from the initial settlement of the region around 5500 B.C. to the first contact with Europeans in A.D. 1492. Based on faunal and botanical remains, ethnohistoric accounts, ethnographic analogies, and archaeological artifacts associated with root crop horticulture, it is widely understood that the first human management of plants in the Caribbean started in Preceramic times  $(-5500-400$  B.C.), and intensified during the Early Ceramic Age (400 B.C. $-A.D. 600/800$ ). By the Late Ceramic Age (A.D. 600/ 800-1492) pre-Columbian Caribbean Amerindians subsisted

Corresponding author. Tel.:  $+31$  715276455.

E-mail address: [h.l.mickleburgh@arch.leidenuniv.nl](mailto:h.l.mickleburgh@arch.leidenuniv.nl) (H.L. Mickleburgh).

predominantly on home gardening, cultivating staple food plants originating in the South American mainland such as manioc (Manihot esculenta) and sweet potato (Ipomoea batatas). These were supplemented by a range of other fruits and vegetables, next to meat and fish ([Newsom and Pearsall, 2003](#page-9-0); [Newsom and Wing,](#page-9-0) [2004](#page-9-0); [Rouse, 1992](#page-10-0); [Sturtevant, 1969](#page-10-0)).

Recent microbotanical studies of residues on stone tools and pottery in the region have brought to light some interesting and unexpected aspects of pre-Columbian plant consumption, including evidence suggesting that maize (Zea mays)  $-$  hitherto thought to have been a relatively late introduction to the region and considered to have been of minor importance to the overall diet  $$ was used early in the history of occupation of the islands and may have comprised an important component of the broad-based mixed horticulture practiced during the entire pre-Columbian period ([Berman and Pearsall, 2000,](#page-9-0) [2008;](#page-9-0) [Pagán-Jiménez, 2007,](#page-9-0) [2009,](#page-9-0) [2011;](#page-9-0) [Pagán-Jiménez et al., 2005](#page-9-0); [Pagán-Jiménez and](#page-9-0) [Rodríguez-Ramos, 2007](#page-9-0); [Pearsall, 2002\)](#page-9-0). Furthermore, cooking and preparation implements known as burenes or clay griddles traditionally associated with manioc horticulture have yielded starch grains belonging to a variety of plants (including maize), and even fatty residues of meat and fish [\(Rodríguez-Suárez and](#page-10-0) [Pagán-Jiménez, 2008](#page-10-0)). Surprisingly, no manioc microremains



<sup>0305-4403/\$ -</sup> see front matter  $\odot$  2012 Elsevier Ltd. All rights reserved. doi[:10.1016/j.jas.2012.02.020](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2012.02.020)

were recovered from these implements and their minimal presence in ceramic, coral and stone tools from sites spanning the pre-Columbian occupation of the region has led Pagán-Jiménez to question the degree of importance which has conventionally been attributed to this crop in Caribbean archaeology ([Berman and](#page-9-0) [Pearsall, 2008;](#page-9-0) [Pagán-Jiménez, 2009,](#page-9-0) [in press\)](#page-9-0).

These studies are changing our view of pre-Columbian plant use in the Caribbean, most significantly in showing that maize, a crop of considerable importance in contemporaneous mainland societies, may have been more common than previously thought. Macrobotanical evidence for maize consumption in the region is scarce, and excepting recent ancient starch grain studies, it has a strikingly low signal in the archaeological record, raising the question of this crop's importance in pre-Columbian Caribbean subsistence [\(Lane](#page-9-0) [et al., 2008](#page-9-0)). The precise social and cultural contexts of maize consumption are still sketchy. One way of helping resolve this issue is by studying individual plant food consumption patterns.

Here, we present the results of the first regional starch grain analysis of 30 samples of dental calculus adhering to human teeth from 14 pre-Columbian sites in the insular Caribbean, i.e., the islands in the Caribbean Sea as opposed to the mainland areas of the Carib-bean which surround the islands ([Fig. 1,](#page-2-0) [Table 1](#page-3-0)).<sup>1</sup> The results pertain to the period between ca. 350 B.C.-A.D. 1600, a time frame in which important social and cultural changes associated with multivectorial pan-Caribbean interactions took place. These developments include the foundation, expansion and consolidation of regional social networks, in which material goods were exchanged across large distances in order to uphold social and ancestral ties ([Mol, 2011](#page-9-0); [Rodríguez-Ramos, 2010;](#page-10-0) [Rodríguez-Ramos and Pagán-Jiménez,](#page-10-0) [2006\)](#page-10-0). Important sociopolitical developments involving increased settlement stability, development of increased independency in community resource procurement, and growing regional settlement hierarchy in the Late Ceramic Age were grounded in these social interaction networks (e.g., [Crock and Carder, 2011;](#page-9-0) [Hofman and](#page-9-0) [Hoogland, 2011](#page-9-0); [Samson, 2010](#page-10-0)). This regional approach is unique in that it reveals highly detailed individual plant food consumption patterns across space and time, allowing us to study age and sex differences and shed light on the overall degree of importance of various crops. Patterns of damage to the starch grains, indicating the use of heat and pressure, give important insights into processing and cooking techniques. Our findings on the processing of starches for consumption are based in part on the results of a grinding experiment (Appendix A) aimed at documenting patterns of grinding damage in maize starch grains at different developmental stages. The results of this experiment with modern maize starches shed new light on pressure damage to starches, contributing to our knowledge of archaeological starch grains in general.

#### 1.1. Ancient starch grain analysis of dental calculus

Dental calculus is the mineralized form of dental plaque, a biofilm containing food remains and bacteria, which forms naturally on the teeth, and when it is not removed may mineralize into calculus ([Hillson, 1996;](#page-9-0) [Lieverse, 1999\)](#page-9-0). During the formation of dental plaque, food particles such as plant microremains may become trapped, and are protected from chemical breakdown by salivary amylase [\(Juan-Tresserras et al., 1997](#page-9-0)). Once plaque mineralizes into calculus, these microremains are protected within the robust mineral matrix, aiding their preservation ([Cummings and](#page-9-0) [Magennis, 1997;](#page-9-0) [Hardy et al., 2009\)](#page-9-0). Starch grains recovered from human dental calculus provide an excellent opportunity to better understand plant use, crop cultivation, and culinary practices. They can be used to distinguish between food plants versus plants used for non-food products such as ointments and pigments, as in most cases plant microremains found in the mouth will have derived from the food. Also, unprocessed or raw plants which would not leave residues on tools, can be identified [\(Cummings and Magennis,](#page-9-0) [1997](#page-9-0); [Hardy et al., 2009;](#page-9-0) [Henry and Piperno, 2008](#page-9-0); [Henry et al.,](#page-9-0) [2011;](#page-9-0) [Piperno and Dillehay, 2008\)](#page-9-0).

Even so, starch grains trapped in dental calculus do not simply reflect the range of plant foods consumed by an individual, as consumption of a plant does not guarantee that its starches are preserved in the calculus. Likewise, the frequency of consumption of particular plants is hard to predict; presumably frequent consumption raises the chances of starches becoming trapped. However, there are differences in starch production in different taxa and different plant organs, making any prediction of frequency of consumption based on the number of starches recovered highly unreliable. In many cases, starches simply can not be identified, as not all plants produce diagnostic starches. In addition, the process of calculus formation is still poorly understood. Various factors, including diet, oral hygiene, salivary flow and genetics influence the rate of calculus deposition, and as a consequence the time frame of accumulation in individuals is hard to predict ([Hillson, 1996](#page-9-0); [Lieverse, 1999](#page-9-0)). Generally, medium to large calculus deposits are thought to have accumulated over at least a number of years [\(Brothwell,1981;](#page-9-0) [Li et al., 2010](#page-9-0); [Henry and Piperno,](#page-9-0) [2008;](#page-9-0) [Piperno and Dillehay, 2008\)](#page-9-0).

### 1.2. Maize in the pre-Columbian Caribbean

Maize was originally thought to have been a late pre-Columbian introduction to the Caribbean archipelago, most likely from the South American mainland, with macrobotanical remains currently known only from Late Ceramic Age (Chican Ostionoid; A.D. 1000-1500) contexts in the Greater and northern Lesser Antilles ([Pearsall, 2002;](#page-9-0) [Newsom and Deagan, 1994](#page-9-0); [Newsom and Wing, 2004](#page-9-0); [Rouse, 1992;](#page-10-0) [Sauer, 1966](#page-10-0)). It was purportedly not consumed as a staple food in the Caribbean, and some suggest it was consumed only in ritual or restricted highstatus contexts [\(Newsom, 2006](#page-9-0); [Newsom and Deagan, 1994](#page-9-0); [Newsom and Pearsall, 2003](#page-9-0); [Newsom and Wing, 2004](#page-9-0); see also [Piperno, 2002\)](#page-9-0). Its very low signal in the archaeological record has led [Newsom \(2006\)](#page-9-0) to propose the plant was consumed only as a supplementary food in its immature state. Sixteenth-century chronicler Gonzalo Fernández de Oviedo y Valdés description of the use of maize in Hispaniola and the other Caribbean islands in its green state or as roasted kernels adds credence to this idea (de [Oviedo y Valdés, 1851](#page-9-0) Vol. I: 266). Pearsall'[s \(2002\)](#page-9-0) research has shown that maize likely comprised an important component of the broad-based mixed horticulture practiced during the Late Ceramic Age occupation of the region. Furthermore, evidence of maize agriculture has recently been found in the form of pollen grains in lake sediments from the interior of the Dominican Republic, providing a secure dating of cal. A.D. 1060, and hinting at possible large scale cultivation of maize ([Lane et al., 2008\)](#page-9-0).

While the bulk of macrobotanical evidence for maize in the Caribbean pertains to the Late Ceramic Age, some argue that it may have been introduced to the region at a much earlier stage, perhaps even by the first migrants to the islands. Recent research is steadily uncovering more evidence of 'early maize consumption' in the region. Starch grains on chert microliths have shown that by at least A.D. 800 and perhaps earlier, the inhabitants of the Bahamas used maize, along with chili (Capsicum sp.) and perhaps manioc and other starchy plants such as marunguey (Zamia sp.). Significantly, the investigators conclude that maize was "part of a broad-based

 $1$  The final project includes 60 samples of dental calculus from various sites throughout the region. Here, we present the results of the analysis of the first 30 samples.

H.L. Mickleburgh, I.R. Pagán-Jiménez / Journal of Archaeological Science xxx (2012) 1–11 3

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Fig. 1. Map of the Caribbean showing the sites used in this study: 1. El Chorro de Maíta; 2. Juan Dolio; 3. El Cabo; 4. Punta Macao; 5. Maisabel; 6. Tutu; 7. Kelbey's Ridge 2; 8. Anse à la Gourde; 9. Point de Caille; 10. Escape; 11. Manzanilla; 12. Malmok; 13. Tanki Flip; 14. Canashito.

diet [...] and was not a supplemental or "curiosity" crop" [\(Berman and](#page-9-0) [Pearsall, 2008:](#page-9-0) 194). Analyses of stone grinding implements from sites in Puerto Rico, Vieques, the Dominican Republic, Cuba, and Saba have revealed that maize was being consistently exploited as early as 3000 B.C. up to the contact period around A.D. 1500 ([Pagán-](#page-9-0)[Jiménez, 2007,](#page-9-0) [2009](#page-9-0), [2011,](#page-9-0) [in press](#page-9-0); [Pagán-Jiménez et al., 2005;](#page-9-0) [Pagán-Jiménez and Rodríguez-Ramos, 2007\)](#page-9-0).

Stable isotope analysis of carbon and nitrogen in human bone has provided evidence of differential dietary practices within and between three Ceramic Age Puerto Rican sites ([Pestle, 2010\)](#page-9-0). At all three sites a notable enrichment in  $\delta^{13}C_{ap}$  values was observed, which Pestle interprets as showing that  $C_4/CAM$  plants comprised a moderate to substantial portion of the diet [\(Pestle, 2010](#page-9-0); [Smith and](#page-10-0) [Epstein, 1971;](#page-10-0) see also [Stokes, 1998](#page-10-0)). The consumption of C4/CAM plants, by inference including maize, at all three sites was not restricted to a small (elite) group. Some of the samples dated to a few centuries earlier than previously accepted dates for the integration of maize into the Caribbean islands. However, while considering the possibility that maize was the cause of  $\delta^{13}C_{ap}$  enrichment in over 200 human skeletons, [Pestle \(2010\)](#page-9-0) takes care to note a number of other  $C_4/CAM$  plants, which could have been the cause, including amaranth (Amaranthus sp.), century plant (Agave antillarum), pineapple (Ananas comosus) and prickly pear cactus (Opuntia sp.).

## 2. Materials and methods

Thirty human teeth from burial contexts in 14 sites throughout the Caribbean archipelago were chosen (Fig. 1, [Table 1](#page-3-0)). Based on previous analyses of the dental wear and pathology in these assemblages, it is clear that these populations were consuming very large amounts of starchy foods, along with marine and terrestrial proteins (e.g., [Mickleburgh, 2007,](#page-9-0) [2011\)](#page-9-0). The samples derive from sites dating mostly to the Late Ceramic Age, with the exception of Malmok and Canashito, which date to the Preceramic or Archaic Age of the southern insular Caribbean, and Escape, which dates to the Early Ceramic Age. The site of El Chorro de Maíta dates to the Late Ceramic and Early Contact period. The multi-component sites of Maisabel and Tutu offered the opportunity of sampling Early Ceramic Age and Late Ceramic Age individuals from the same site. Although we strived to include equal numbers of early and late individuals overall, there is a general lack of early (especially Archaic) skeletal material from secure archaeological contexts.

In total, calculus from teeth of 11 males, 10 females, 4 juveniles, and 5 adults of unknown sex was analyzed. Where possible, an adult male, an adult female and a juvenile were selected for each site. In some cases this was not possible due to the lack of calculus or dental material from individuals of known age and sex. Also, where possible, individuals with known radiocarbon dates were selected.

Extracting protocol for dental calculus consisted first of choosing the area on each tooth with the largest calculus deposit. Photographs were taken of the sampling area on each tooth, prior to and after extraction. Each tooth was washed separately using distilled water and new sterilized dental brushes, and calculus was extracted using a sterilized dental pick. The weight and volume of the individual samples was recorded. Subsequently, they were treated with a 10% solution of HCl at room temperature for 24 h. Distilled water was added to each microcentrifuge tube containing the individual samples; these were agitated manually for 20 s and

## <span id="page-3-0"></span>4 H.L. Mickleburgh, J.R. Pagán-Jiménez / Journal of Archaeological Science xxx (2012) 1-11

#### Table 1

Samples by site, age, sex, radiocarbon date and cultural assignment. LCA = Late Ceramic Age. ECA = Early Ceramic Age.



<sup>a</sup> No starches recovered.

**b** Site dating based on relative chronology (ceramic typology).

then centrifuged (4500 rpm for 3 min). This step was repeated twice. The samples were mounted on microscope slides, adding a half drop of glycerol to each, and examined with an Olympus BH-2 microscope with polarization capacity at  $40\times$ . Starch grains were counted, described and photographed, and compared to Pagán-Jiménez' reference collection ([Pagán-Jiménez, 2007](#page-9-0)) comprising starch grains from 68 genera and 61 species of wild, domesticated, and cultivated species from the Antilles, continental tropical America, and parts of the Old World, in order to identify taxa. Published literature on diagnostic criteria for starch grains was also consulted [\(Pearsall et al., 2004;](#page-9-0) [Piperno and Dillehay, 2008](#page-9-0); [Piperno and Holst, 1998;](#page-9-0) [Reichert, 1913](#page-9-0)). Sample selection was performed by Mickleburgh at Leiden University, while starch grain extraction and analysis was performed by Pagán-Jiménez at the Universidad de Puerto Rico (Río Piedras).

Patterns of damage to the starch grains, indicative mainly of the manner of preparation of the plants for consumption were documented according to a reference collection of starch grains resulting from various processing experiments (Appendix A), and were also compared to previously documented patterns of damage ([Babot, 2003](#page-9-0); [Dorsey et al., 2009](#page-9-0); [Henry et al., 2009;](#page-9-0) [Lamb and Loy,](#page-9-0) [2005](#page-9-0); [Piperno et al., 2004](#page-9-0)). Thus, secure and tentative

identifications of starches in this study are based on diagnostic and/ or distinctive features described elsewhere and on the results of new experiments by Pagán-Jiménez (Appendix A). Specific morphometric features used are shape, size, presence and location of the hilum within the granule, presence and appearance of fissures, presence and type of pressure facets, presence and appearance of lamellae, and in some cases the appearance and projection of the Maltese cross. A detailed discussion of the diagnostic criteria used for the identification of some of the taxa in this study is presented in Appendix B.

### 3. Results

A very high success rate (90%) was obtained for the extraction and identification of starch grains from dental calculus [\(Table 2](#page-5-0)). In all but 3 samples, starch grains were recovered and identified. The number of starch grains per sample is slightly lower than is the case in similar studies in other regions (e.g., [Hardy et al., 2009;](#page-9-0) [Henry et al., 2011;](#page-9-0) [Henry and Piperno, 2008;](#page-9-0) [Li et al., 2010](#page-9-0); [Piperno and Dillehay, 2008\)](#page-9-0). Adaptation of the extraction technique<sup>2</sup> did not improve the retrieval rate, and as the method we have used is comparable to those used in other studies (i.e., [Hardy et al., 2009;](#page-9-0) [Henry and Piperno, 2008](#page-9-0)), we feel that the lower retrieval rate is most likely the result of poor preservation of the material (most of the remains, including the calculus deposits, were very poorly preserved).

A large number of tuberous root plants were identified (Appendix B), including marunguey (Zamia sp., Zamia pumila, cf. Zamia erosa), sweet potato, cocoyam (Xanthosoma sp., Xanthosoma cf. sagittifolium), arrowhead (cf. Sagittaria sp.) and manioc [\(Fig. 2\)](#page-6-0). The latter was represented by a single starch grain retrieved from a female individual from Malmok, Aruba (burial 10). The rhizomes Cannaceae (which includes the economic species such as achira or gruya), Marantaceae (for which arrowroot is one of the betterknown economic species) and Calathea (Calathea sp.) were also tentatively identified. A number of legumes were identified, including Canavalia sp., common bean (Phaseolus vulgaris), and other wild legumes (e.g., Fabaceae, Leguminoseae). Finally, in almost half of the samples which yielded starch grains (13 individuals from 11 sites), maize starch was discovered.

Many of the starch grains displayed alterations in morphometric characteristics and patterns of damage consistent with pressure and heat treatment [\(Dorsey et al., 2009;](#page-9-0) [Henry et al., 2009](#page-9-0); [Fig. 2](#page-6-0), [Table 2,](#page-5-0) Appendix A). Several starch grains ([Table 3](#page-7-0)) displayed substantial enlargement when compared to previously published data (e.g., [Pagán-Jiménez, 2007\)](#page-9-0). Most enlarged starch grains belonged to maize, and their sizes correspond to the size ranges registered in the grinding experiment, where modern maize starch grains were submitted to intensive grinding (Table 2 in Appendix A).

In most cases it was possible to distinguish between damage patterns consistent with heat treatment in the presence of liquid (i.e., boiling; as evidenced by the presence of folds and large central depressions) versus heat treatment without large amounts of liquid (i.e., baking, toasting, parching, popping, etc.; as evidenced by a 'crushed' appearance). Only three cases damage consistent with boiling were identified, while dry heat treatment was fairly common ( $n = 39$ ).

Patterns of damage consistent with pressure treatment were observed in all but two of the individuals who yielded starch grains ([Fig. 2](#page-6-0), [Table 2](#page-5-0)), with 70.2% (99/141) of all starches showing signs of pressure treatment. Based on the results of the grinding experiment, the damage was mostly found to be related to grinding or

pounding (Appendix A). Radial as well as asymmetric striations and fissures in the grains were the most common signs of damage observed in the maize starches and other recovered starches (see also Fig. 2 in Appendix A). Other patterns consistent with pressure damage were the presence of a bright ring around the hilum area (mainly in maize starches, but also in cocoyam and common bean), the enlargement of some starch grains, and the formation of a central depression in the hilum area as registered in the grinding experiment. Together with other types of central depressions associated with heat (i.e., "folds" or "shadows" sensu [Henry et al.,](#page-9-0) [2009\)](#page-9-0) and grinding damage patterns (Appendix A), this suggests that in the case of maize the kernels were intensively ground or pounded in a mature or dry state (previously soaked) and subsequently baked, indicating that the starch was most likely consumed as bread, as opposed to in its immature or green state.

As discussed above, recent research has steadily been pushing back the date at which there is paleoethnobotanical evidence for maize consumption in the pre-Columbian Caribbean. Our results show that maize was consumed by two individuals (burials 16 and 30; see Tables [1a](#page-3-0)nd [2](#page-5-0)) dated respectively to the Early and Late Ceramic Age phases of occupation at Tutu, St. Thomas. Previous research based on macrobotanical remains at the site indicated maize consumption in the Late Ceramic Age (cal. A.D. 1150–1500) phase of occupation ([Pearsall, 2002;](#page-9-0) [Sandford et al., 2002\)](#page-10-0).

The single individual from the Archaic period site of Canashito on Aruba yielded a relatively high number of maize starch grains, with evidence of grinding and baking. Although this individual has not yet been radiocarbon dated, a closely associated burial, was dated to cal. 350 B.C.-A.D. 150, and artifacts collected at the site and from the burial pits clearly put Canashito in the Preceramic or Archaic Age of the southern insular Caribbean ([Dijkhoff and](#page-9-0) [Linville, 2004](#page-9-0); [Versteeg et al., 1990;](#page-10-0) [Wagenaar Hummelinck, 1959\)](#page-10-0).

The identification of other domestic and wild taxa such as sweet potato, beans, cocoyam, marunguey, and wild legumes is consistent with previous starch grain research on lithic, ceramic and shell tools in Puerto Rico, Cuba, the Bahamas and the Dominican Republic ([Berman and Pearsall, 2008](#page-9-0); [Pagán-Jiménez, 2011,](#page-9-0) [in press](#page-9-0)) where a broad spectrum, but locally variable diet has been proposed for different periods in the pre-Columbian occupation of the region.

Apart from starch grains a number of other inclusions were found in the calculus samples. Seven of the samples yielded spiny-globular echinate phytoliths which were tentatively identified as belonging to palms ([Fig. 2\)](#page-6-0). Charcoal particles were found in 16 of the 30 samples. The presence of these particles deep in the mineral matrix of the calculus indicates that they are highly unlikely to be the result of post mortem contamination as previously suggested [\(Wesolowski et al.,](#page-10-0) [2010](#page-10-0)). Instead, it appears that charcoal was present in the food or at least in the oral cavity of these individuals during life, perhaps as the result of cooking techniques. Baking or roasting foods directly in the fire or on glowing embers would result in the adherence of charcoal particles in and on the food.

## 4. Discussion

The large number of plants identified in the entire sample set, and at the individual sites, shows that these individuals consumed a large variety of cultivars, confirming earlier studies that have highlighted the variety in starchy plant foods being consumed in the region ([Berman and Pearsall, 2008;](#page-9-0) [Newsom and Pearsall,](#page-9-0) [2003;](#page-9-0) [Newsom and Wing, 2004;](#page-9-0) [Pagán-Jiménez, 2007,](#page-9-0) [2011\)](#page-9-0). The variety of tubers and rhizomes identified in the sample is especially interesting when contrasted with the relative paucity of manioc, which was identified by only a single starch grain. Although considered a staple crop during the Ceramic Age in the insular Caribbean and northeastern South America, manioc

<sup>2</sup> Only distilled water was used to dissolve the samples instead of HCl, in order to establish whether starches were being lost during sample processing.

Please cite this article in press as: Mickleburgh, H.L., Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., New insights into the consumption of maize and other food plants in the pre-Columbian Caribbean from starch grains trapped in human dental calculus, Journal of Archaeological Science (2012), doi:10.1016/ j.jas.2012.02.020

## <span id="page-5-0"></span>Table 2

Identified taxa per sample and the number of individual starch grains identified. Site abbreviations are as follows: AAG = Anse à la Gourde, CB = El Cabo, CM = El Chorro de Maíta, CS = Canashito, ES = Escape, JD = Juan Dol KR = Kebey's Ridge 2, MB = Maisabel, MK = Malmok, MZ = Manzanilla, PC = Point de Caille, PM = Punta Macao, TF = Tanki Flip, TT = Tutu. Other abbreviations are: cl = cluster of starches, P = pressure, F = fermentation, H =  $W =$  water. Thus H/W  $=$  heat in the presence of water, and P/H?  $=$  pressure, possibly with heat.

Site			AAG AAG AAG	CB	<b>CM</b>	CM	<b>CS</b>	ES	ID	ID	KR	KR	MB	MK		MK MZ	MZ	MZ	PC	PC	PM	PM	PM	TF	TT	<b>TT</b>	TT
<b>Burial</b>	196	197	2217	$85 - 40 - 17$ 16		47	3	36	10		22A 313	132	5	6	10 <sup>10</sup>	118	267/269 291 32				36 6A	10A 25		200	16	30	32A
Calathea sp.																											
Canavalia sp.																											
cf. Cannaceae																											
Fabaceae																					-1						
cf. Fabaceae																											
Ipomoea batatas										$\overline{1}$												2					
cf. Ipomoea batatas							$\overline{2}$																				
Leguminoseae						3		2																			
Manihot esculenta																											
cf. Marantaceae																											
Phaseolus vulgaris																											
Phaseolus sp.																											
cf. Sagittaria sp.													$\overline{7}$														
Xanthosoma cf. sagittifolium																											
Xanthosoma sp.														$cl \sim 30$													
cf. Xanthosoma sp.																											cl $\sim$ 50
Zamia sp.																		2									
cf. Zamia sp.																		$\overline{2}$						$\overline{1}$			
cf. Zamia erosa (syn. amblyphyllidia)													2														
Zamia pumila																							2				
cf. Zamia pumila										$\overline{c}$																	
Zea mays	$\overline{2}$				$\overline{1}$		$\mathbf{1}$		3							2			-1							3	
cf. Zea mays							$\overline{2}$									3									2	2	
Unidentified			$\overline{2}$			-1	6	2	$\overline{1}$				$\boldsymbol{\Delta}$	6	1	$\overline{4}$	2	3					$\overline{2}$	2	3		5
Unidentified transitory starch																									cl		2 cl
																									~13		$\sim$ 35/50
Grain damage	P		P	P	P/H	$\mathbf{P}$	D	P		H	H	D	Þ	P	P		P	D	P		D				P	D	P
	P/H	P/H	P/H	P/H?		P/H	P/H		$P/H$ $P?$				P?		H	P/H	H/W	P/H	P/H				P/H	P/H?	P/H	P/H	P/H
						H?	H		H?				P/H?			P/H?		H					P/F?	H	H?	H	
													H?			H							H		H		
																H/W											
Total <sup>a</sup>			5	5		5	12	$\Delta$					14	6	3	10	6		2			3	6		6	6	10

<sup>a</sup> Starch clusters are not included in the totals, as the precise number of starches in the cluster is unknown.

**RTICLE IN PR** 

m<br>ഗ



<span id="page-6-0"></span>

Fig. 2. Microbotanical residues recovered from human dental calculus. Rows A-F, starch grains and a raphide. Row G, phytoliths. Rows A and B: Zea mays starches. (A1, A2, A3, B1, B2, B3 [2]) securely identified Zea mays, (A4, A5, B3[1]) tentatively identified Zea mays. Row C: (C1, C4, C5) Zamia sp. (secure); (C2) Zamia pumila (secure); (C3) Zamia erosa (tentative). Row D: (D1) Phaseolus sp. (secure); (D3, D4) Ipomoea batatas (tentative); (D5) Manihot esculenta (secure). Row E: (E1) Calathea sp. (secure); (E3) Sagittaria sp. (tentative); (E4) Xanthosoma sp. (tentative); (E5) Cannaceae (tentative). Row F: (F1) Xanthosoma sp. starch cluster (secure); (F2) transitory-like unidentified starches (probably from leaves); (F3, F4) pressure damage; (F5) unidentified raphide. Row G: (G1, G2, G3) globular echinate phytoliths likely from palm stems, leaves or fruits. CD1, large central depression; CD2, small central depression; R, bright ring; Db, double-border; F, general fissures; F1, radial fissures or striations; F2, radial to asymmetric fissures; P, pressure facets; H, hilum; L, lamellae; Rs, rough topography; Fs, fold/shadow (likely produced by boiling). All scale bars are 30 µm. Dark field micrographs with cross polarized light are showing general characteristics of Maltese crosses and correspond to the same starches to its immediate left. (C1 and G3) Chorro de Maíta; (C2) El Cabo; (A2) Juan Dolio; (G5) Punta Macao; (A1, E1, E2, E4, G4) Anse á la Gourde; (G1, G2) Escape; (D3) Kelbey's Ridge 2; (A3, C3, E3) Maisabel; (D5, F1) Malmok; (F4) Canashito; (A4, A5, B1, C4, C5, F5) Manzanilla; (B3) Point de Caille; (B4, B5, D4, E5, F2, F3) Tutu.

<span id="page-7-0"></span>8 **H.L. Mickleburgh, J.R. Pagán-Jiménez / Journal of Archaeological Science xxx (2012) 1–11** 

Table 3

Size ranges of starch grains identified in this study.

Taxa <sup>a</sup>	Size ranges in um	Mean size in um	Total no. of identified starches
<b>Domesticates</b>			
Manihot esculenta	26.3	26.3	1
Phaseolus vulgaris	28.9	28.9	1
Zea mays	$11.6 - 30$	$21.7 (\pm 4.2)$	17
cf. Zea mays	$11.3 - 33$	23.4 $(\pm 5.6)$	10
Cultivars			
Ipomoea batatas	$24.8 - 37.5$	30.4 $(\pm 3.7)$	6
cf. Ipomoea batatas	$13.2 - 48.8$	28.5 $(\pm 13.2)$	5
Xanthosoma cf. sagittifolium	24.4	24.4	1
cf. Xanthosoma sp.	12	12	1
Wild			
Zamia pumila		34.8 $(\pm 5.7)$	3
cf. Zamia pumila	$26.3 - 43.1$	43.8 $(\pm 24.5)$	3
Zamia sp.	$16.9 - 83$	$47.6~(\pm 15.1)$	$\overline{4}$
cf. Zamia sp.	$33.8 - 66.8$	36.3 $(\pm 9.8)$	6
cf. Zamia erosa	$18.8 - 45$	$27.6 (\pm 7.2)$	$\overline{2}$
(syn. amblyphyllidia)			
Canavalia sp.	$22.5 - 32.6$	41.3 $(\pm 14.6)$	2
Calathea sp.	$25.1 - 56.2$	54.4	1
Fabaceae	54.4	$27.7 (\pm 11.3)$	6
cf. Fabaceae	$8 - 42$	$31 (\pm 11.5)$	5
Leguminoseae	$11.3 - 46.9$	31.4 $(\pm 9.1)$	5
cf. Sagittaria sp.	$11.3 - 45.8$	24.6 $(\pm 5.1)$	7
cf. Marantaceae	$16.9 - 33.8$	21.4	1
cf. Cannaceae	21.4	37 $(\pm 2)$	$\overline{2}$
	$18.8 - 56.3$		

Starch clusters are excluded.

has to date been extremely scarce in paleoethnobotanical remains studied in the region. Ancient manioc starches have been identified in a total of seventeen (10.2%) of 168 tools sampled so far from the insular Caribbean and French Guiana [\(Pagán-Jiménez,](#page-9-0) [2011\)](#page-9-0). Of the 28 burenes, artifacts traditionally associated with the preparation and baking of manioc bread, only one revealed manioc starches. Interestingly, the stone 'teeth' of grater boards, also traditionally associated with manioc processing in the Caribbean and Venezuela, have yielded a variety of tuber and seed starches, but very little evidence of manioc [\(Berman and Pearsall,](#page-9-0) [2008](#page-9-0); [Pagán-Jiménez, 2009;](#page-9-0) [Perry, 2005](#page-9-0)). The reasons for this scarcity of recovered manioc starches in the pre-Columbian neotropics are not well understood. As manioc starches have been successfully recovered and identified in a small number of cases, it is hard to assume that taphonomic or laboratory biases are the (sole) cause. Recent studies consistently suggest that manioc was simply a tuber crop of minor importance prior to European contact ([Berman and Pearsall, 2008;](#page-9-0) [Pagán-Jiménez, in press](#page-9-0); [Perry, 2005;](#page-9-0) see also Appendix B).

The lack of manioc starches in our samples underscores previous suggestions that various other plants such as marunguey and sweet potato may have fulfilled the role of staple food traditionally attributed to manioc [\(Berman and Pearsall, 2008](#page-9-0); [Pagán-](#page-9-0)[Jiménez, 2009](#page-9-0), [2011\)](#page-9-0). Our data support the view that a variety of root crops fulfilled that purpose in the subsistence economy.

The identification of marunguey in this study is illuminating. Previous starch grain analyses at various archaeological sites in the Greater Antilles revealed that the tuberous stem of this wild plant was an important food item throughout human occupation of the area ([Pagán-Jiménez, 2011,](#page-9-0) [in press](#page-9-0)). So, the presence of marunguey starch grains at sites in the Greater Antilles is unsurprising as wild populations of this genus are known to have grown in limestone areas in Puerto Rico, Hispaniola, Cuba, Jamaica, the Cayman Islands, and the Bahamas for many millennia. Its presence in islands in the southern Caribbean, such as Aruba and Trinidad is highly interesting, however, as no wild marunguey populations currently grow there, and there is no botanical or palynological evidence for its presence prior to European contact. These islands share some important geological characteristics (limestone formations) with areas in the Greater Antilles, which are favorable for the development of wild populations of marunguey. Three different scenarios explaining these findings are posited: (a) the inter-island exchange of marunguey and introduction of this species into home gardens or agricultural plots beyond its natural range, (b) the inter-island exchange of marunguey (finished) food items, or (c) the presence of wild populations of marunguey in these southern islands during the pre-Columbian period. Needless to say this matter warrants further investigation.<sup>3</sup>

Extremely significant is the high frequency of maize starch. Almost half of the individuals in this sample consumed maize, often in its mature or dry state, ground and probably baked as bread. Combined with the presence of charcoal remains in many of the samples, this may be direct evidence of the barbacoa or barbecue cooking technique - where foods (including fauna) are baked in or over an open fire  $-$  described in ethnohistoric sources (de [Oviedo y](#page-9-0) [Valdés, 1851](#page-9-0) Vol. I: 559 and 561). The large number of individuals who yielded maize starch appears to confirm earlier suggestions that maize may not have been as restricted a food source as previously thought [\(Pagán-Jiménez and Oliver, 2008](#page-9-0); [Pagán-](#page-9-0)[Jiménez, 2011](#page-9-0); [Pestle, 2010\)](#page-9-0). Interestingly, none of the juveniles in the sample yielded maize starch, perhaps indicating at least some form of restricted access to the plant. However, based on such a small number of juvenile individuals (three who yielded starch grains) this is hard to support at this time. Excepting this, there is no evidence in the form of mortuary practices and/or grave goods, age, sex, or otherwise indicating that the individuals who yielded maize starch in this sample belonged to an elite class or had a different social status than those who did not yield maize starch. No significant differences were found between males and females. Besides, as discussed above, those lacking maize starch grains in their calculus did not necessarily avoid eating maize, as consumption of a plant does not guarantee that starch grains will be preserved in the calculus. This means that the actual number of individuals consuming maize may have been higher. However, as discussed above, the presence (or absence) of starch grains in dental calculus gives no reliable indication of the frequency of consumption. We are cautious to suggest that these individuals were consuming substantial amounts of maize, as there is some evidence which indicates maize consumption was minimal.

The spatial and chronological distribution of the samples containing maize in this study represent more evidence that access to the plant was not highly restricted, as our data show maize was consumed at 11 of the 14 sites represented, as early as 350 B.C.-A.D. 150 and as late as A.D.  $1250-1600$  $1250-1600$  $1250-1600$  (see Tables [1a](#page-3-0)nd 2). It is clear that maize consumption in the insular Caribbean was a far more ubiquitous practice than once thought (sensu [Newsom, 2006\)](#page-9-0). However, at the moment it seems unlikely that the importance of maize in the subsistence economy was on a par with that of others crops, such as some of the root crops mentioned above. While our data seem to indicate maize consumption was not highly exclusive, some previous paleoethnobotanical and bone isotopic studies appear to show that it was most likely not consumed in great amounts as a staple crop.

At the site of Tutu, St. Thomas, the presence of macrobotanical remains, which included a tiny amount of charred maize kernels dated to the Late Ceramic Age phase of occupation, led [Pearsall](#page-9-0) [\(2002\)](#page-9-0) to suggest small amounts of maize were consumed, although it did not fulfill an important role in subsistence practices

 $3$  For a more in depth discussion of the consumption of marunguey in the pre-Columbian Caribbean, see Appendix B.

<span id="page-8-0"></span>at the site. A study of phytoliths in soil samples found no evidence of maize production or consumption ([Piperno, 2002\)](#page-9-0), and the presence of Marantaceae, Palmae and squash (Cucurbita sp.) led Piperno to conclude that the vegetal portion of the diet consisted mainly of tubers and tree crops. A human bone isotopic study revealed a mean bone collagen  $\delta^{13}$ C value of  $-15.50 \pm 1.80\%$ (s.d. 2), and a mean bone collagen  $\delta^{15}N$  value of 12.10  $\pm$  1.70 $\frac{\delta}{\delta}$ predominantly reflecting a large marine component in the protein portion of the diet and the consumption of reef and pelagic fishes ([Norr, 2002](#page-9-0)). The mean human bone apatite carbonate  $\delta^{13}$ C value is  $-10.30 \pm 2.40\%$  (adjusted by Norr to 9.50%), which [Norr \(2002\)](#page-9-0) interpreted to reflect a diet intermediate between the  $C_3$  plants in the food chain and marine, but which given our evidence for maize consumption at the site, may also reflect a very small component of  $C_4$  plants in the diet. Comparison of our results with these previous studies thus indicates that  $C_4$  plants (such as maize) may have been consumed in small amounts by the inhabitants of Tutu.

At the Late Ceramic Age site of En Bas Saline, Haiti, researchers discovered that maize macroremains were clearly associated with the centrally positioned high-status or elite area of the site, specifically the center where the cacique's (chief's) residence was situated. The remains were recovered from what appear to have been feasting pits or communal hearths ([Deagan, 2004](#page-9-0); [Newsom,](#page-9-0) [1998;](#page-9-0) [Newsom and Deagan, 1994](#page-9-0)), and the finds were interpreted as evidence for a distinct social significance of and potentially restricted access to maize. A similar setting has been suggested for Formative societies in Mesoamerica, where maize was considered a highly important and ritually significant plant, and was primarily consumed during communal feasts [\(Seinfeld, 2011\)](#page-10-0).

As discussed above, recent stable isotope analysis at three Ceramic Age Puerto Rican sites has revealed that C4/CAM plants likely comprised a large portion of the vegetal diet, with an estimated average of 47  $\pm$  8.1% of dietary energy being provided by C4/CAM carbohydrates [\(Pestle, 2010](#page-9-0)). The results of this study indicated that maize was unlikely to have been a restricted or 'elite' food, but despite the considerable  $\delta^{13}C_{\text{an}}$  enrichment in the majority of individuals, maize was not thought to be a staple crop at any or all of these sites, as a number of other  $C_4/CAM$  plants likely contributed to the diet.

Considering the above discussion in the light of our own evidence, we suggest that maize consumption in the pre-Columbian Caribbean may have been associated mainly with communal activities such as feasting, as opposed to the more mundane and common consumption of staple foods in the nonpublic domain. The lack of evidence for highly restricted access to maize, combined with indications that only small to moderate amounts were consumed, supports the view that maize consumption may have been associated with the public domain, or in other words, communal ritual and ceremonial activities. A highstatus or 'special' significance attached to the plant would have made it particularly suitable as a feasting food ([Hayden, 1996\)](#page-9-0), consumed only on special occasions, but by most (if not all) individuals. This scenario may go some way in explaining the paucity of macrobotanical maize remains in archaeological deposits in the region, as the currently identified remains of individual feasting events are scarce ([Curet and Pestle, 2010;](#page-9-0) [Crock and Carder, 2011;](#page-9-0) [Deagan, 2004;](#page-9-0) [Newsom and Deagan, 1994](#page-9-0); [Oliver and Narganes](#page-9-0) [Storde, 2003\)](#page-9-0). While numerous studies in the Caribbean have linked elaborately shaped and decorated pottery with communal feasting activities (e.g., [Boomert, 1999](#page-9-0); [Hofman, 1993](#page-9-0)), and recent research has focused on recognizing feasting activities from the composition and size of a site's faunal assemblage ([Crock and](#page-9-0) [Carder, 2011](#page-9-0); but see also [Curet and Pestle, 2010](#page-9-0)), defining the 'archaeological footprint' of individual feasting events in the region remains a challenge.

Finally, it is important to keep in mind that the status of maize, whether mundane or socially and ritually significant, may have been highly variable across the region, warranting more detailed investigation on a local scale.

## 5. Conclusions

Our results support previous findings that a broad spectrum, but locally variable diet was consumed throughout the Caribbean islands, from ca.  $350$  B.C. $-A.D.$  1600. In this broad spectrum a variety of root crops functioned as staple crops in the subsistence economy, including marunguey and sweet potato. We found no indications for the traditionally assumed heavy reliance on manioc cultivation in the region.

Our results also clearly show that maize consumption in the pre-Columbian Caribbean archipelago was not a highly restricted practice, and, consequently, does not appear to be associated with an elite or high-status class of people. Neither are there any indications of sex based differences in access to the plant. Maize was consumed by individuals dating to the Preceramic/Archaic Age, Early Ceramic Age, and Late Ceramic Age occupation of the region, mostly ground and baked as bread, instead of in its immature or 'green' state. Naturally, this again illuminates the issue of the general lack of macrobotanical evidence for maize consumption in the region. We suggest this may, among other things, be the result of an association of maize with communal feasting activities, which are currently rarely identified in the archaeological record of the region.

Finally, this study has highlighted the value of an approach geared toward exposing past human activity on an individual level. Future work, among other things, will focus on potential intra-site age and sex differentiation in plant food consumption.

## Acknowledgments

This work was financially supported by the Leiden University Byvanck Fund. We are most grateful to Eric Branford, Richard Callaghan, Raymundo Dijkhoff, Marc Dorst, Corinne Hofman, Menno Hoogland, Harold Kelly, Kathy Martin, Cristian Martínez Villanueva, Mike Roca, Mary Sandford, Glenis Tavarez Maria, Roberto Valcárcel Rojas, and Jorge Ulloa Hung for giving us free access to archaeological materials and for granting the permission to select samples for analyses. Dr. Elvira Cuevas and Larry Díaz (Center for Applied Tropical Ecology and Conservation, Universidad de Puerto Rico, Río Piedras) and Wim Kuijper (Leiden University) facilitated working space while Dr. James Ackerman (Universidad de Puerto Rico, Río Piedras) provided laboratory equipment. We would like to thank Adriana Churampi for sharing her invaluable expertise on ethnohistoric sources and Pepijn van der Linden for creating the map for this article. We are extremely grateful to Arie Boomert, Anne van Duijvenbode, Corinne Hofman, Menno Hoogland, Wim Kuijper, Jason Laffoon, Angus Mol, Alice Samson and Rachel Schats for their very helpful comments on earlier drafts of this paper. Last but not least, we are grateful to two anonymous reviewers for their extremely valuable comments and advice regarding the first version of this paper.

#### Appendix. Supplementary material

Supplementary material associated with this article can be found, in the online version, at [doi:10.1016/j.jas.2012.02.020](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2012.02.020).

#### References

Atiles, G., 2004. Excavaciones Arqueologicas de Punta Macao. Informe de Campo. Museo del Hombre Dominicano, Santo Domingo, Dominican Republic.

- Babot, M. del Pilar, 2003. Starch grain damage as an indicator of food processing. In: Hart, D.M., Wallis, L.A. (Eds.), Phytolith and Starch Research in the Australian-Pacific-Asian Regions: The State of the Art. Pandanus Books. Australian National University, Canberra, pp. 69–81.
- Berman, M.J., Pearsall, D.M., 2000. Plants, people, and culture in the prehistoric Central Bahamas: a view from the three Dog site, an Early Lucayan settlement on San Salvador Island, Bahamas. Lat. Am. Antiq.  $11$   $(3)$ ,  $219-239$ .
- Berman, M.J., Pearsall, D.M., 2008. At the Crossroads: starch grain and phytolith analyses in Lucayan prehistory. Lat. Am. Antiq. 19 (2),  $181-203$ .
- Boomert, A., 1999. Saladoid sociopolitical organization. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 18, 55-77.
- Brothwell, D.R., 1981. Digging up Bones. Cornell University Press, Ithaca.
- Crock, J.G., Carder, N., 2011. Diet and Rank in a Caribbean Maritime Society. Lat. Am. Antiq. 22 (4), 573-594.
- Cummings, L.S., Magennis, A., 1997. A phytolith and starch record of food and grit in Mayan human tooth tartar. In: Pinilla, A., Juan-Tresserras, J., Machado, M.J. (Eds.), 1997. Estado Actual de los Estudios de Fitolitos en Suelos y Plantas: The State-of- the-Art of Phytoliths in Soils and Plants, vol. 4. Monografías del Centro de Ciencias Medioambientales, Medioambientales, CSIC, Madrid, pp. 211-218.
- Curet, L.A., Pestle, W.J., 2010. Identifying high-status foods in the archeological record. J. Anthropol. Archaeol. 29 (4), 413-431.
- Deagan, K.A., 2004. Reconsidering Taíno social dynamics after Spanish conquest: gender and class in Culture contact studies. Lat. Am. Antiq. 69 (4), 597-626.
- Dijkhoff, R.A.C.F., Linville, M.S. (Eds.), 2004. The Archaeology of Aruba: The Marine Shell Heritage. Archaeological Museum of Aruba, Oranjestad.
- Dorsey, S., Perry, L., Reinhard, K., Santorno, C., Teixeira-Santos, I., 2009. Impacts of Empire expansion on household diet: the Inca in Northern Chile's Atacama Desert. Plos One  $4(11)$ ,  $1-5$ .
- Dorst, M.C., 2007. The SAN-1 site at Manzanilla: creating a site-scale pottery classification at a multi-component Ceramic Age site in Trinidad. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 21, 328-337.
- Dorst, M.C., 2008. The Pre-Columbian SAN-1 Site, Manzanilla, Trinidad. In: Preliminary Research Report Fieldwork. Leiden University, Leiden.
- Drusini, A., Businaro, F., Luna Calderòn, F., 1987. Skeletal biology of the Taino: a preliminary report. Int. J. Anthropol. 2  $(3)$ , 247-254.
- Friesinger, H., Reuer, E., Steininger, F.F., Faupl, P., 1986. Grabungen und Forschungen auf St. Lucia. Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften, Vienna.
- Hayden, B., 1996. Feasting in prehistoric and traditional societies. In: Wiessner, P., Schiefenhövel, W. (Eds.), Food and the Status Quest: An Interdisciplinary Perspective. Berghahn Books, Providence, pp. 127-149.
- Hardy, K., Blakeney, T., Copeland, L., Kirkham, J., Wrangham, R., Collins, M., 2009. Starch granules, dental calculus and new perspectives on ancient diet. J. Archaeol. Sci. 36 (2), 248-255
- Henry, A.G., Brooks, A.S., Piperno, D.R., 2011. Microfossils in calculus demonstrate consumption of plants and cooked foods in Neanderthal diets (Shanidar III, Iraq; Spy I and II, Belgium). Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 108 (2), 486-491.
- Henry, A.G., Hudson, H.F., Piperno, D.R., 2009. Changes in starch grain morphologies from cooking. J. Archaeol. Sci. 36, 915-922.
- Henry, A.G., Piperno, D.R., 2008. Using plant microfossils from dental calculus to recover human diet: a case study from Tell al-Raqa'i, Syria. J. Archaeol. Sci. 35  $(7)$ , 1943-1950.
- Hillson, S.W., 1996. Dental Anthropology. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.
- Hofman, C.L., 1993. In search of the native population of pre-Columbian Saba. Part One. Pottery styles and their interpretations. PhD Dissertation, Leiden University, Leiden.
- Hofman, C.L., Hoogland, M.L.P., 2011. Unravelling the multi-scale networks of mobility and exchange in the precolonial circum-Caribbean. In: Hofman, C.L., Van Duijvenbode, A. (Eds.), Communities in Contact. Essays in Archaeology, Ethnohistory, and Ethnograph y of the Amerindian circum-Caribbean. Sidestone Press, Leiden, pp. 15-44
- Hofman, C.L., Hoogland, M.L.P., Delpuech, A., 2003. Spatial Organisation at a Troumassoid settlement: the case of Anse à La Gourde, Guadeloupe. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 19, 162-172.
- Hoogland, M.L.P., Hofman, C.L., 1999. Expansion of the Taino cacicazgos towards the Lesser Antilles. The case of Saba. J. Soc. des Américanistes 85, 93-113.
- Jansen, R., Dorst, M.C., 2007. Spatial patterning and structures of the multicomponent Ceramic Age site SAN-1, Manzanilla, Trinidad. Proc. Int. Congr.  $Caribb.$  Archaeol. 21, 315 $-327$ .
- Juan-Tresserras, J., Lalueza, C., Albert, R.M., Calvo, M., 1997. Identification of phytoliths from prehistoric human dental remains from the Iberian Peninsula and the Balearic Islands. In: Pinilla, A., Juan-Tresserras, J., Machado, M.J. (Eds.), 1997. Estado Actual de los Estudios de Fitolitos en Suelos y Plantas: The State-of-the-Art of Phytoliths in Soils and Plants, vol. 4. Monografías del Centro de Ciencias Medioambientales, CSIC, Madrid, pp. 197-204.
- Lamb, J., Loy, T.H., 2005. Seeing red: the use of Congo Red dye to identify cooked and damaged starch grains in archaeological residues. J. Archaeol. Sci. 32, 1433-1440.
- Lane, C.S., Horn, S.P., Orvis, K.H., 2008. The earliest evidence of Ostionoid maize agriculture from the interior of Hispaniola. Caribb. J. Sci. 44 (1), 43-52.
- Li, M., Yang, X.Y., Wang, H., Wang, Q., Jia, X., Ge, Q., 2010. Starch grains from dental calculus reveal ancient plant foodstuffs at Chenqimogou site, Gansu Province. Sci. China Earth Sci. 53  $(5)$ , 694-699.
- Lieverse, A.R., 1999. Diet and the aetiology of dental calculus. Int. J. Osteoarchaeol. 9  $(4)$ , 219-232.
- Mickleburgh, H.L., 2007. Teeth Tell Tales. In: Dental wear as evidence for cultural practices at Anse à la Gourde and Tutu. Sidestone Press, Leiden.
- Mickleburgh, H.L., 2011. Teeth Tell Tales. Subsistence strategies and dental wear patterns at Anse à la Gourde (Guadeloupe) and Tutu (U.S. Virgin Islands). Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol.  $23, 732-742$ .
- Mol, A.A.A., 2011. Bringing interaction into higher spheres. Social distance in the Late Ceramic Age Greater Antilles as seen through ethnohistorical accounts and the distribution of social valuables. In: Hofman, C.L., Van Duijvenbode, A. (Eds.), Communities in Contact. Essays in Archaeology, Ethnohistory, and Ethnography of the Amerindian circum-Caribbean. Sidestone Press, Leiden, pp. 61–86.
- Moravetz, I., Callaghan, R., 2011. Archaeological Impact Mitigation at Escape, St. Vincent and the Grenadines. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 23, 640–654.
- Newsom, L.A., 1998. Mangroves and root crops: the Archaeobotanical record from En Bas Saline, Haiti. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 16, 52-66.
- Newsom, L.A., 2006. Caribbean maize. First farmers to Columbus. In: Staller, J., Tykot, R., Benz, B. (Eds.), Histories of Maize: Multidisciplinary Approaches to the Prehistory, Linguistics, Biogeography, Domestication, and Evolution of Maize. Academic Press, Amsterdam, pp. 325-343.
- Newsom, L.A., Deagan, K.A., 1994. Zea mays in the West Indies: the archaeological<br>and early historic record. In: Johannessen, S., Hastorf, C.A. (Eds.), Corn and Culture in the Prehistoric New World. Westview Press, Boulder, pp. 203-217.
- Newsom, L.A., Pearsall, D.M., 2003. Trends in Caribbean Island Archaeobotany. In: Minnis, P.E. (Ed.), Plants and People in Ancient Eastern North America. Smithsonian Books, Washington, pp. 347-412.
- Newsom, L.A., Wing, E.S., 2004. On Land and Sea. In: Native American Uses of Biological Resources in the West Indies. University of Alabama Press, Tuscaloosa.
- Norr, L., 2002. Bone isotopic analysis and prehistoric diet at the Tutu site. In: Righter, E. (Ed.), The Tutu Archaeological Village Site: A Multidisciplinary Case Study in Human Adaptation. Routledge, London, pp. 263-273.
- Oliver, J.R., Narganes Storde, Y.M., 2003. The Zooarcheological remains from Juan Miguel Cave and Finca De Doña Rosa, Barrio Caguana, Puerto Rico. Ritual Edibles or Quotidian Meals? Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 20, 227-242.
- Oviedo y Valdés, G.F. de, 1851. Historia General y Natural de las Indias, Islas y Tierra-Firme del Mar Océano. La Real Academia de la Historia, Madrid.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., 2007. De Antiguos Pueblos y Culturas Botánicas en el Puerto Rico Indígena. In: Paris Monographs in American Archaeology 18, BAR International Series. Archaeopress, Oxford.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., 2009. Nuevas Perspectivas sobre las Culturas Botánicas Precolombinas de Puerto Rico: Implicaciones del Estudio de Almidones en Herramientas Líticas, Cerámicas y de Concha. Cuba Arqueol. 2 (2), 7-23.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., 2011. Early phytocultural processes in the Pre-Colonial Antilles. A Pan-Caribbean survey for an ongoing starch grain research. In: Hofman, C.L., Van Duijvenbode, A. (Eds.), Communities in Contact. Essays in Archaeology, Ethnohistory, and Ethnography of the Amerindian circum-Caribbean. Sidestone Press, Leiden, pp. 87-116.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., in press. Human-plant dynamics in the precolonial antilles: A synthetic update, in Keegan, W., Hofman, C.L., Rodríguez-Ramos, R. (Eds.), The Oxford Handbook for Caribbean Archaeology. Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., Rodríguez López, M.A., Chanlatte Baik, L.A., Narganes Storde, Y.M., 2005. La temprana introducción y uso de algunas plantas domesticas, silvestres y cultivos en Las Antillas precolombinas. Diálogo Antropol. 3 (10), 7-33.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., Oliver, J.R., 2008. Starch residues on lithic artifacts from two contrasting contexts in North Central Puerto Rico: Los Muertos Cave and Vega Nelo Vargas Farmstead. In: Hofman, C.L., Hoogland, M., van Gijn, A.L. (Eds.), Crossing the Borders: New Methods and Techniques in the Study of Archaeological Materials from the Caribbean. The University of Alabama Press, Tuscaloosa, pp. 137-158.
- Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., Rodríguez-Ramos, R., 2007. Sobre el Origen de la Agricultura en las Antillas. In: Reid, B. (Ed.), 2007. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 21, Vol. 1. University of the West Indies, Trinidad, pp. 252-259.
- Pearsall, D.M., 2002. Analysis of charred botanical remains from the Tutu site. In: Righter, E. (Ed.), The Tutu Archaeological Village Site: A Multidisciplinary Case Study in Human Adaptation. Routledge, London, pp. 109-134.
- Pearsall, D., Chandler-Ezell, K., Zeidler, J.A., 2004. Maize in ancient Ecuador: results of residue analysis of stone tools from the Real Alto site. J. Archaeol. Sci. 31, 423-442. Perry, L., 2005. Reassessing the traditional interpretation of "Manioc" artifacts in the
- Orinoco Valley of Venezuela. Lat. Am. Antiq 16 (4), 409-426. Pestle, W.J., 2010. Diet and Society in Prehistoric Puerto Rico. An Isotopic Approach.
- PhD dissertation, University of Illinois, Chicago.
- Piperno, D.R., 2002. Phytolithic remains from the Tutu site. In: Righter, E. (Ed.), The Tutu Archaeological Village Site: A Multidisciplinary Case Study in Human Adaptation. Routledge, London, pp. 135-140.
- Piperno, D.R., Dillehay, T.D., 2008. Starch grains on human teeth reveal early broad crop diet in northern. Peru. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. 105, 19622-19627.
- Piperno, D.R., Holst, I., 1998. The presence of starch grains on prehistoric stone tools from the humid neotropics: indications of early tuber use and agriculture in Panama. J. Archaeol. Sci. 25, 765-776.
- Piperno, D.R., Weiss, E., Holst, I., Nadel, D., 2004. Processing of wild cereal grains in the Upper Palaeolithic revealed by starch grain analysis. Nature 430,  $670 - 673.$
- Reichert, E.T., 1913. The Differentiation and Specificity of Starches in Relation to Genera, Species, Etc. (Part II). Carnegie Institution of Washington, Washington DC.
- Righter, E. (Ed.), 2002. The Tutu Archaeological Village Site: A Multidisciplinary Case Study in Human Adaptation. Routledge, London.

<span id="page-9-0"></span>

<span id="page-10-0"></span>Rodríguez-Ramos, R., 2010. Rethinking Puerto Rican Precolonial History. University of Alabama Press, Tuscaloosa.

- Rodríguez-Ramos, R., Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., 2006. Interacciones Multivectoriales en el circum-Caribe Precolonial. Un Vistazo desde las Antillas. Carib. Stud. 34 (2),  $99 - 139$
- Rodríguez-Suárez, R., Pagán-Jiménez, J.R., 2008. The Burén in precolonial Cuban archaeology: new information regarding the use of plants and ceramic griddles during the Late Ceramic Age of Eastern Cuba Gathered through starch analysis. In: Hofman, C.L., Hoogland, M.L.P., Van Gijn, A.L. (Eds.), Crossing the Borders: New Methods and Techniques in the Study of Archaeological Materials from the
- Caribbean. University of Alabama Press, Tuscaloosa, pp. 159–169.<br>Rouse, I., 1992. The Tainos. In: Rise and Decline of the People Who Greeted Columbus. Yale University Press, New Haven.
- Samson, A.V.M., 2010. Renewing the house: Trajectories of social life in the yucayeque (community) of El Cabo, Higüey, Dominican Republic, AD 800 to 1504. PhD dissertation, Leiden University, Leiden. Sidestone Press, Leiden.
- Sandford, M.K., Bogdam, G., Kissling, G.E., 2002. Biological adaptation in the prehistoric Caribbean: Osteology and bioarchaeology of the Tutu site. In: Righter, E. (Ed.), The Tutu Archaeological Village Site: A Multidisciplinary Case Study in Human Adaptation. Routledge, London, pp. 209-229.
- Sauer, C.O., 1966. The Early Spanish Main. University of California Press, Berkeley.
- Seinfeld, D.M., 2011. Agricultural consumption patterns and Formative Period sociopolitical developments at the Maya site of San Estevan, Belize. PhD dissertation, Florida State University, Tallahassee.
- Siegel, P.E., 1992. Ideology, power, and social complexity in prehistoric Puerto Rico. PhD dissertation, State University of New York, Binghamton.
- Smith, B.N., Epstein, S., 1971. Two categories of <sup>13</sup>C/<sup>12</sup>C ratios for higher plants. Plant Physiol. 47, 380-384.
- Stokes, A.V., 1998. A Biogeographic Survey of Prehistoric Human Diet in the West Indies using Stable Isotopes.PhD dissertation, University of Florida, Gainesville.
- Sturtevant, W., 1969. History and ethnography of some West Indian starches. In: Ucko, P.J., Dimbleby, G.W. (Eds.), The Domestication and Exploitation of Plants and Animals. Aldine, Chicago, pp. 177-199.
- Tavarez- María, G., Luna Calderón, F., 2007. Estudios de Antropologia Fisica del cementerio de Macao, Republica Dominicana. Proc. Int. Congr. Caribb. Archaeol. 21, 692-701.
- Valcárcel-Rojas, R., Weston, D.A., Mickleburgh, H.L., Laffoon, J.E., Van Duijvenbode, A., 2011. El Chorro de Maíta. A diverse approach to a context of diversity. In: Hofman, C.L., Van Duijvenbode, A. (Eds.), Communities in Contact. Essays in Archaeology, Ethnohistory, and Ethnography of the Amerindian circum-Caribbean. Sidestone Press, Leiden, pp. 225-252.
- Veloz-Maggiolo, M., 1972. Arqueología Prehistórica de Santo Domingo. McGraw-Hill Far Eastern Publishers Ltd, Singapur.
- Versteeg, A.H., Rostain, S. (Eds.), 1997. The Archaeology of Aruba: The Tanki Flip Site. Archaeological Museum Aruba, Oranjestad.
- Versteeg, A.H., Tacoma, J., Van de Velde, P., 1990. Archaeological Investigations on Aruba: The Malmok Cemetary. Archaeological Museum of Aruba, Oranjestad.
- Wagenaar Hummelinck, P., 1959. Indiaanse Skeletvondsten op Aruba en Curacao. New West Indian Guide 39, 77-92.
- Wesolowski, V., Ferraz Mendonça de Souza, S.M., Reinhard, K.J., Ceccantini, G., 2010. Evaluating microfossil content of dental calculus from Brazilian sambaquis. J. Archaeol. Sci. 37  $(6)$ , 1-13.
- Weston, D.A., 2010. Human Skeletal Report: Kelbey's Ridge 2 and Spring Bay 1c, Saba. In: Manuscript on File at the Faculty of Archaeology. Leiden University, Leiden.
- Weston, D.A., 2011. Human Skeletal Report: Anse a la Gourde, Guadeloupe. In: Manuscript on File at the Faculty of Archaeology. Leiden University, Leiden. Leiden University, Leiden.
- Weston, D.A., Schats, R., 2010. Human Skeletal Report: Maisabel, Puerto Rico. In: Manuscript on File at the Faculty of Archaeology. Leiden University, Leiden.